



Comparative Costs for Initial Training of Primary Teachers in Pakistan

Sajjad Hayat AKHTAR, Parveen MUNSHI, & Muhammad Naseer Ud DIN
University of Sindh, Pakistan
sajjadakhtar2010@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT :

This research study is a descriptive analysis of the cost effectiveness of formal and non-formal system of the primary teacher certificate (PTC) programme in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa region, of Pakistan. In this research the Allama Iqbal Open University distance PTC trainees and conventional-education PTC trainees were considered as the population for the study, their course duration, courses admission system, cost effectiveness, teacher training, job opportunities, and examination system follow-up were investigated. Specific indicators were used to determine the extent to which these components contributed to the efficient running of the PTC programme in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The objectives of the study were to compare the inputs for producing PTC teachers by formal and by non-formal system, to compare the characteristics of the PTC-trained teachers by formal and by non-formal system, to identify the needs of non-formal education in the province Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and to determine the cost effectiveness of non-formal PTC teachers. Data were collected through survey and questionnaires. The results showed the majority of the PTC students had faced problems such as the inadequacy of trained teachers, lack in computers, and inadequate internet facilities. There was a wide spectrum of issues ranging from lack of well integrated media with content difficulties, difficulties in learning from media, and lack in guidance and counselling. This study was significant as it compares the actual training of PTC teachers by the formal system with that by the non-formal system. On the basis of previous research studies and insights from the general literature, the present study tested the hypothesis that the cost-effectiveness of open education was greater than the cost of the regular system. The results found that the regular formal system provided more effective, easier, cheaper and better quality teacher training.

INTRODUCTION

Education is a social process by which we lead person from darkness to light or from ignorance to knowledge. It is a process in which we try to develop the different capacities and potentialities of person in all aspects of life. It is a whole some development of the whole child.

In Pakistan the formal system can not cope with the demand of education for all. In order to over-come this problem, Allama Iqbal Open University was established at Islamabad in June 1974. It provides education and training to the masses at large through its distance education approach. Allama Iqbal Open

University is one of the institutions because of its philosophy, system approach, functions and overall structure. The university provides multi-level and multidisciplinary education from the gross roots to the higher level programmes for the distance learners out of which one is the Primary Teacher Certificate (PTC) course which was introduced in October 1979. It comprises three parts, which are (i) principle of teaching (ii) over all content and methodology of the primary school curriculum and (iii) a practical component of workshop plus supervised teaching practice. Allama Iqbal Open University has started teacher-training programme at PTC level; because the elementary colleges can not cope with the needs and demands of the people. The elementary colleges can not ride the on going quantitative requirement of the primary school. Many organizations of government and non-government are applying educational technology effectively in imparting education and training to the masses at large of these organizations. Allama Iqbal Open University is very significant in imparting education and training to masses.

It has successfully completed literacy programme. It is offering many programmes in general education and also in vocational education. The teachers of primary and secondary schools are being trained through PTC, PTOC, CT, B.Ed, M.Ed, MA EPM, MA education, MA special education courses in higher education such as M.Phil, Ph.D in various subjects. The efforts of AIOU are acknowledged by UNESCO and had awarded it with “Noma” awarded. Teacher occupies the most crucial position in the entire spectrum of educational activities. The availability of a good number of educated and professionally trained teachers therefore possess the greatest challenges to policy makers and planners of education in Pakistan. Obviously Pakistan is constrained to find out alternative methods of expanding educational facilities at all levels. The best and cheap alternative is distance education, which is being used in most parts of the world for development and prosperity of the people. Efforts are being made to make distance education more and more effective, and comprehensive.

LITERATURE:

The teacher training institutions both in formal and non-formal systems are preparing teachers for primary schools but the quality of the teachers is questioned in these days. Both the systems prepare teachers by using different methods and techniques. The cost incurred on prospective teachers also differs. This study was

designed to investigate the different aspects of training, teaching techniques, instructional technology, educational facilities and costs borne by prospective teachers. The findings of the study will indicate some weaknesses which can be recovered by adopting suitable measures.

Education is not only necessary from the point of view of enhancing literacy but also contributes to socio-economics and political development of the country. The existing system of education in the developing countries obviously can not cope with the demands of education for all. So, non-formal education was adopted to meet the needs of the individual.

“Need and significance of non-formal education can not be over emphasized for developing countries like Pakistan facing huge financial constraints and committed to development in the shortest possible time. Keeping in view the growing need and significance of non-formal education approach for Pakistan, several agencies, institutions has under taken numerous non-formal education programmes in the country”. (Ghafoor 1990, p.17)

“In our discussion about cost-effectiveness, we take the definition the “Cost-Effectiveness (CE) analysis. It refers to the evaluation of alternatives according to both their costs and their effects with regard to producing some outcome of set of outcomes”. The alternative here is between conventional universities and distance education institutions. Accepting the effectiveness of education of both systems, we look into the costs and the efficiency. As Chang and his colleagues stated, “More specially, efficiency in our case can be defined as effective instruction at the lowest possible costs – cost-effective instruction in a literal sense”. (ADB 1986, p.519)

It is a known fact that entire development depends on the quality of education, especially the scientific and technological education; un-luckily formal system of education is becoming deficient every where to cope with the needs of people. In our country the government is unable to provide educational facilities to each individual at all levels. The best and cheap alternative is distance education, which is being used in most parts of the world for development and prosperity of the people. Efforts are being made to make distance education more and more comprehensive and effective.

The AIOU was established in June 1974, following the passing of the People's Open University Act.

“Open university is being used in several countries to provide education and training to people who can not leave their homes and jobs for full time studies. A people's open university will, therefore, be established to provide part time educational facilities through correspondence courses, tutorials, seminars, workshop, laboratories, television, radio broadcasts and other mass communication media”. (Education Policy 1972, p.22)

METHODOLOGY:

The survey method was used during the research. Research was based on descriptive study because it describes the opinion of the pass-outs of both the systems. Total PTC trained students of elementary colleges of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Allam Iqbal Open University was taken as a population of the study. Total PTC graduates from formal system were 490 and total PTC graduates from non-formal system were 501. 150 PTC graduate from formal system and 150 PTC graduates from Allam Iqbal Open University were taken as a sample. The tools of collecting data were questionnaires.

The researcher administered two self assessments on sampled PTC graduate from formal system and PTC graduate from non-formal system. Five points likert scale was used. For demographic profile percentage was used to compare the frequencies of the respondents. Mean score was applied the measure the cost-effectiveness, job opportunities and examination of both programmes. The researcher examined the official records at the Allam Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, DEO primary office Mardan, Government Elementary College for boys Peshawar, Govt Elementary Colleges for boys Ambar (Swabi) and Govt Elementary colleges for women Dargi (Malakand Agency).

ANALYSIS

Table No: 1

Analysis of the general opinion of regular PTC pass-outs regarding the cost effectiveness of the regular system

Statements	SA	A	UNC	DA	SDA	Mean
Regular PTC is cheaper than PTC of AIOU.	46	41	2	10	51	3.1
Admission in elementary college is easier than PTC of AIOU.	67	12	17	28	16	3.5
Formal system of education provides a better teacher training than of AIOU.	41	61	9	21	18	3.5
Conventional system of PTC is more effective than PTC of AIOU.	59	34	25	22	10	3.7
The courses offered by conventional system are complete in all respects.	37	58	28	24	3	3.0
Time duration for the courses is sufficient.	25	39	6	61	19	2.9
The courses offered by regular system are more difficult than the courses offered by AIOU.	60	19	19	37	15	3.0
The system for ht final examination is satisfactory.	44	64	14	22	60	3.7
The regular PTC teachers are better than the teachers provided by AIOU.	42	23	27	55	3	3.3
The matter offered by regular system of PTC is richer than the mater offered by AIOU.	33	48	23	34	12	3.3
New courses should be offered in regular PTC.	55	21	22	42	10	3.4
The output of training is up to the level.	31	38	46	26	9	3.3
The follow up programme is essential for its PTC teacher.	62	45	17	22	4	3.9
The regular PTC courses lack deficiency.	21	77	26	13	13	3.5
Regular PTC examination is more difficult than the PTC of AIOU examination.	61	27	20	10	32	3.0
Regular PTC examination may result in good score but there is no real increase in the knowledge.	37	31	21	44	17	2.7

Table No: 2

Comments of the regular PTC Trainees

S.No	Comments	Frequency	%
1	Courses are to be well explained.	82	54.66
2	Instructor use guide to teach their students.	5	3.33
3	Conventional system is very costly.	4	2.66
4	PTC provides job opportunities.	3	2
5	The courses are not systematic.	1	0.66

It is evident from table 82 respondents said that courses should be explained well. 5 said that instructor used guides to teach their students.

Table No: 3

Analysis of the general opinion of AIOU PTC pass-outs regarding the cost effectiveness of the open system

Statements	SA	A	UNC	DA	SDA	Mean
PTC of AIOU is cheaper than of regular PTC.	46	41	2	10	51	3.1
Courses PTC of AIOU are difficult than regular PTC.	67	12	17	38	16	3.5
Admission in PTC of AIOU is easier than regular PTC.	71	58	15	5	1	4.2
AIOU provides better teacher training than a formal	73	29	28	17	3	4.0

	system.						
34	AIOU provides better teacher training than a formal system.	80	22	16	23	9	3.94
35	PTC programme of AIOU is effective than conventional PTC.	60	40	25	25	0	3.73
36	The courses offered by AIOU met needs of the trainees conventional PTC.	82	31	31	3	3	4.24
37	AIOU PTC courses are free of deficiencies.	20	41	43	4	44	2.94
38	The time duration for the courses is sufficient.	29	84	15	14	8	3.74
39	PTC teachers of AIOU are better teachers than teachers of conventional system.	60	28	43	8	1	3.92
40	The matter offered by AIOU in PTC courses is richer than conventional system.	57	62	28	3	0	4.15
41	New areas should be added to non-formal education.	66	47	31	6	0	4.15
42	Output of AIOU is up to the level.	40	54	26	7	23	3.54
43	The follow up programme is essential for its PTC teachers.	70	49	12	6	13	4.04
44	Distance education examinations are more difficult than the public examination.	65	37	17	29	2	3.89
45	Distance education examination may result in good score but there is no real increase in the knowledge of the students.	18	41	34	22	35	2.9

Table No: 4

Comments of the regular PTC Trainees

S.No	Comments	Frequency	%
1	AIOU programme are cheaper than conventional programmes.	68	45.33
2	The AIOU pass out have less job opportunities.	68	45.33
3	Time duration for ht course is long.	67	44.66
4	Study centres should be easily accessible.	20	13.33
5	Courses of AIOU are very difficult.	12	8

Comments of the respondents group about the cost- effectiveness of AIOU. ,68 respondents said that Allama Iqbal Open University programmes are cheaper than conventional programmes. 68 respondents said that the Allama Iqbal Open University pass out have less job opportunities. 67 respondents said that the time duration for the course is long.

Table No: 5

Suggestions of the regular PTC Trainees

S.No	Suggestions	Frequency	% Age
1	Curriculum should be changed	42	28
2	Time Duration should be increased	31	20.66
3	Semester system should be introduced	28	18.66
4	Practical work should be increased	22	14.66
5	New areas should be added in the course	13	8.66

Majority of 42 Respondents said that curriculum should be changed. 31 said that duration should be increased. 28 said that semester system should be introduced.

Table No: 6

Suggestions of the AIOU Respondents

S.No	Suggestions	Frequency	% Age
1	Certificate procedure should be changed	15	10
2	New areas should be added in the course	12	8
3	Tutors should provide guidance and deliver lecture	6	4
4	Certificate of distance education and conventional education should be alike	6	4
5	Computer should be introduced	6	4

15 Respondents said that certificate procedure should be changed. 12 respondents said that new areas should be added in the course. 6 respondents said that tutors should provide guidance and deliver lecture.

Table No: 7

Comparison of Both the Systems

Comparison of the respondents	Regular system	Open system
1. Qualification	-	-
Matric	53	18
F.A / F.Sc	64	97
B.A / B.Sc	17	35
M.A / M.Sc	16	-
2. Occupation	-	-
In-Service	141	105
Un-Employed	9	45
3. Expenditure on Books	563 rupees	-
4. Expenditure on Admission	5000 rupees	2500
5. Expenditure on Boarding	4000 rupees	-
6. Expenditure on Examination	400 rupees	-
7. Expenditure on Transport	2800 rupees	-
8. Expenditure on Stationary	500 rupees	-
9. Opinion on Cost	3.14 Mean Score	3.41 Mean Score
10. Opinion on Admission	3.50 Mean Score	4.28 Mean Score
11. Opinion on Teachers Training	3.57 Mean Score	4.01 Mean Score
12. Opinion on System	3.73 Mean Score	3.73 Mean Score
13. Opinion on Courses	3.68 Mean Score	4.24 Mean Score
14. Opinion on Courses Difficulties	3.68 Mean Score	3.50 Mean Score
15. Opinion on Time Duration	2.93 Mean Score	3.74 Mean Score
16. Opinion on Subject Matters	3.37 Mean Score	4.15 Mean Score
17. Opinion on Teachers Efficiencies	3.37 Mean Score	4.15 Mean Score
18. Opinion on New Area to be added	3.46 Mean Score	4.15 Mean Score

19. Opinion on Output	3.37 Mean Score	3.54 Mean Score
20. Opinion on Course Deficiencies	3.53 Mean Score	2.94 Mean Score
21. Opinion on Follow up Programme	3.92 Mean Score	4.04 Mean Score
22. Opinion on Examination	3.68 Mean Score	3.89 Mean Score
23. Opinion on Increasing knowledge	3.78 Mean Score	2.90 Mean Score

As the average score of cost-effectiveness in open system is more effective than that is in regular system. Therefore it shows the effectiveness of open system, and hence the hypothesis is proved numerically.

CONCLUSION:

- It was discovered from the analysis of the data that radio and TV are not accessible as a medium of instruction in study centres.
- The PTC pass outs were confronted with the problems; like in-adequacy of trained teachers and lack of computers and internet facilities. There is wide spectrum of issues relating to the lack of well integrated media with content difficulties and learning from media and the lack provision of guidance and counselling. The study identified that majority of the study centres are deprived from computer technology.
- It was discovered from the analysis of data that regular PTC is cheaper than PTC of AIOU. The respondents said that courses of PTC of AIOU were difficult than regular programme. In addition majority of the respondents said that the formal system of education provides a better teacher training than AIOU. Similarly majority of the respondents said that the conventional system of PTC was more effective than PTC of AIOU.
- It was found that the courses offered by regular system were more difficult than the courses offered by AIOU. The study identified that the regular system for the final examination was satisfactory. It was found that the regular PTC teacher were better than the teachers provided by AIOU. In the same way the respondents claimed that the matter offered by regular system of PTC was richer than the matter offered by AIOU.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. The courses of both the systems should be made simple and short. The courses contents should be related to practical life and national needs. The courses may be curtailed to complete within the prescribed time.

2. The training of PTC teachers through AIOU should be made more effective. Training techniques should be changed and modernized. The period of training should also be enhanced.
3. Follow up programme in both the systems of formal and non-formal should be introduced. Mobile teams of experts should be deputed for this purpose and manageable areas may be given to them for the follow up programme.
4. Examination system of AIOU for PTC teachers should be improved. Most modern techniques of evaluation should be introduced. Techniques of measurement may also be used for obtaining accurate results.
5. The instructors / trainers should explain lessons in classes more clearly with the help of AV aids. TV and VCR may also be used. Model lessons may be delivered through teleclass system.
6. Tutors in non-formal systems are not selected on merit they should be given training and their appointment be made on merit basis. The competent and well- qualified working teachers should be involved in tutorship.
7. Tutorial meeting should be held meaningfully and tutors should explain the contents clearly. The level of the trainees should be kept in view during training.
8. The trainers should use new techniques of teaching / training in the classes. The new techniques include the use of educational technology.
9. Admission in regular system should be made on merit. Special seats should be abolished .Quota system should be finished. All admission should be done on merit.
10. Curriculum of both the systems should be changed and made practical and relevant to national needs. More and more practical work should be included in the curriculum instead of theoretical emphasis.
11. Job opportunities for PTC of AIOU should be enhanced and ensured. All the appointing authorities should be directed to entertain PTC candidates of AIOU without any prejudices.
12. Some new subjects of current importance like computer science, environment education, population education, drugs education and education technology should be thought-giving emphasis or practical work.
13. Time duration of the courses of PTC under formal system should be increased, because all the educational experts have recommended through education policies, reports commissions and committees that present duration is quite

insufficient to prepare professionals.

14. Physical and instructional facilities in formal system teacher training institutions should be made adequate. Moreover, the buildings are inadequate, old and instructional facilities are not available appropriately and those, which are available, are not used properly.
15. Internal system of evaluation / semester system should be introduced in formal system. As this system of internal evaluation is prevalent in most of the countries and it creates sense of responsibilities in teachers and taught.

REFERENCES:

- Asian Development Bank (1986), Distance Education in Asia and the Pacific, Val. II, Proceeding of the regional Seminar of Distance Education Printed in Manila, Philippines.
- Best W.J and Khan J.V (1989) Research In Education, Sixth Edition, New York Prentice Hall.
- Ghafoor. A (1990), Non-Formal Education in Pakistan. Ministry of Education Islamabad.
- Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education, Islamabad.
- Govt. of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (2007), Annual Statistical Report of Schools in North West Frontier Province, Directorate of School & Literacy Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
- Govt. of Pakistan (1999) District Census Report of Mardan Publication No.28.
- Govt. of Pakistan (1999) District Census Report of Nowshera Publication No.55.
- Govt. of Pakistan (1999) District Census Report of Peshawar Publication No.33.
- Ministry of Education (1972), National Education Policy (1972-80).
- Ministry of Education (1995), Elementary Teachers Education Curriculum and Syllabus for Primary Teacher Certificate, Curriculum wing Ministry of Education, Govt. of Pakistan, Islamabad.
- Ministry of Education (1998), National Educational Policy 1998-2010, Islamabad. Ministry of Education.
- Nanda V.K. (1998) Typology of Distance Teaching System, Printed Anmol Publication Pvt. Ltd. New Delhi (India).